

NEW YORK
state department of
HEALTH

Howard A. Zucker, M.D., J.D.
Acting Commissioner of Health

Sue Kelly
Executive Deputy Commissioner

September 11, 2014

David S. Warne
Assistant Commissioner
NYC Department of Environmental Protection
Bureau of Water Supply
465 Columbus Avenue
Valhalla, NY 10595

Dear Mr. Warne:

NYSDOH/USEPA and NYSDEC have reviewed the Catskill Turbidity Control Expert Panel Scope of Work, which was submitted by NYCDEP in accordance with section 4.11 of the Revised 2007 FAD. We offer the following comments:

1. The Revised 2007 FAD states that the scope of work (SOW) for the Expert Panel will "detail the goals and questions to be answered by the panel..." While the proposed SOW lists the goals of the Expert Panel, including a list of questions for the panel to consider would help provide more specific direction to the panel. For example, some questions that should be included are:
 - a. Are the assumptions underlying the Operations Support Tool (OST) modeling appropriate to achieve the most effective use of OST (e.g., the 57-year meteorological data set used to forecast future flows and water quality, reservoir storage goals, streamflow-turbidity relationship, sediment settling characteristics, etc.)?
 - b. Are the performance measures/criteria used by NYCDEP to assess the efficacy of OST effective and sufficient? If not, how might performance measures be improved?
 - c. Is OST capable of accurately predicting the impacts of extreme weather events? If not, what modifications can be made to OST to improve this function? Alternatively, can the panel suggest other approaches to help identify and understand the water system operational issues created under extreme weather conditions?
 - d. Is DEP staffing adequate for operation and continuing maintenance and development of OST?
 - e. Is DEP's instrumentation adequate for reliable operation of OST (e.g., is there sufficient redundancy)?
 - f. Is DEP's quality assurance/quality control for the data used to run OST adequate?

Sincerely,



Pamela L. Young, Ph.D.
Chief, NYC Watershed Section
Bureau of Water Supply Protection

Cc: R. Sokol
T. Boepple
J. Hyde/P. Palmer
P. Sweeney - USEPA
K. Kosinski - NYSDEC
T. Snow - NYSDEC